

### Personal Representative Review of the Record of Proceedings

I acknowledge that on 15 December 2004, I was provided the opportunity to review the record of proceedings for the Combatant Status Review Tribunal involving ISN #312.

I have no comments.

My comments are attached.

  
Name

15 Dec 04  
Date

  
Signature

ISN #312  
Enclosure (6)

## PR Comments on the results of the Tribunal for #312

I do not believe the Tribunal gave proper weight to exhibit D-c. The purpose of D-c was not necessarily to prove that the detainee was not properly classified as an enemy combatant, rather it was to shed light on the veracity of the testimony of detainee [REDACTED]. While the spreadsheet is not a comprehensive document, it does show that detainee has provided information on over 60 detainees, currently at [REDACTED]. These detainees come from varying countries and backgrounds and were in widely separate areas of Afghanistan. In order for [REDACTED] to know over 10% of the detainees by sight and name, he would have to have known almost a similar portion of non-detained Taliban and al Qaida personnel in Afghanistan. This thought strains the imagination. Specifically regarding #312, detainee [REDACTED] indicated that he saw him at [REDACTED] training camp during his [REDACTED] one week of training in April 2001. All documentary evidence indicates that detainee was not in Afghanistan until July 2001 and therefore, [REDACTED] could not have seen him. I investigated [REDACTED] file and prepared the spreadsheet (D-c). After identifying over 60 detainees, I realized that a comprehensive investigation regarding each identified detainee was not possible. However, there were a limited amount that the detainee identified at [REDACTED]. I then reviewed the travels of each of the detainees that [REDACTED] identified at [REDACTED]. Based on the documents in our possession, not one of the detainees that [REDACTED] identified at [REDACTED] was in the country at the time that [REDACTED] would have been able to identify them as being trained at this camp. Barring each of these detainees having elaborate cover stories that have not been compromised over the length of their detainment, the testimony of [REDACTED] should not be relied upon.

[REDACTED]  
LTC, US ARMY